

**Island Communities Impact Assessment - Partial**

HES is a named relevant authority within the [Islands (Scotland) Act 2018](https://www.gov.scot/publications/national-plan-scotlands-islands/#:~:text=The%20Islands%20%28Scotland%29%20Act%20which%20was%20passed%20by,in%20relation%20to%20improving%20outcomes%20for%20island%20communities.). The Corporate Plan Refresh process therefore required an initial screening to determine whether a Full or Partial Island Communities Impact Assessment was needed. HES engaged with the Scottish Government’s Islands Team and, following their advice and guidance, have concluded that a Partial Impact Assessment is the correct approach.

The key factors in determining this partial ICIA approach were:

* The 2019 Corporate Plan was developed through [an engagement process](https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationId=f0218351-7fd6-426d-a7d2-aa2501193492) which included extensive consultation with Island Authorities, organisations and in public forums. That process concluded that none of the actions and outcomes in the Corporate Plan would have significantly different effects on island communities than on any other communities, and that the Plan introduced positive opportunities for a locally tailored approach.
* Given that COVID disrupted 2 years of delivery of the existing 3-year Corporate Plan, a light refresh is being conducted for 2021/22 retaining the same headline themes and outcomes. The island community conclusions from the 2019 consultation are therefore assumed to be unchanged. A full engagement process is planned for the new Corporate Plan starting in 2023.
* Islands will have different local needs and circumstances, in the same way that different communities across Scotland will have different circumstances. HES plans to take the same approach to challenges regardless of location and tailor a solution that best fits the local area. HES has therefore not identified any new, significant issues through the formal ICIA initial screening process, concluding “no” for each of the Scottish Government’s key questions which define the need for a Full ICIA, rather than Partial:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Does your assessment identify any unique impacts on island communities? | **No** |
| Does your assessment identify any potential barriers or wider impacts? | **No** |
| Regarding HES’s approach, does the evidence show different circumstances or different expectations or needs, or different experiences or outcomes? Are these different effects likely? Are these effects significantly different? | **No** |
| Could the effect amount to a disadvantage for an island community compared to the mainland or between island groups? | **No** |

The conclusion of this Partial ICIA is that sentences should be added to the Corporate Plan to recognise the different needs and pressures across communities in Scotland, including islands. The screening evidence considered in reaching this conclusion is summarised below, following the Scottish Government’s required approach.

|  |
| --- |
| **Initial Screening** |
| **Step One: Developing a clear understanding of your objectives** |
| * Is the policy, strategy or service either **new** or **under** review?
* What are the objectives of the policy, strategy or service?
* How are islands identified for the purpose of the policy, strategy or service?
* What are the intended impacts/outcomes and how do these potentially differ in the islands?
 |
| HES is a charitable Non-Departmental Public Body (NDPB) whose statutory functions are set out in the Historic Environment Scotland Act 2014. Its primary purpose is to investigate, care for and promote Scotland’s historic environment and to manage its collections as a national resource for reference, study and research - as set out in the Framework Document between Historic Environment Scotland and the Scottish Government. HES’s purpose, strategic aims and objectives, as agreed by the Scottish Ministers, are published in the HES Corporate Plan approved by Scottish Ministers. The Plan aligns to and leads the delivery of the priorities of the historic environment sector set out in “[*Our Place in Time*](http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0044/00445046.pdf)*”* and supports the Scottish Government’s Purpose delivered through the [National Performance Framework](http://www.gov.scot/About/Performance/scotPerforms/purpose). The Corporate Plan provides strategic direction for our shorter term annual plans such as the [Annual Operating Plan,](https://hescot.sharepoint.com/sites/dc/corpgov/_layouts/15/DocIdRedir.aspx?ID=HESDOC-244780918-1524) annual Directorate Plans and individual performance objectives.The current Corporate Plan ‘*Heritage for All’* commenced in April 2019 and was developed through comprehensive consultation with staff, external stakeholders and included wider audiences whose voices are not often heard in conversations about history and heritage. The feedback helped to fundamentally shape our aims and objectives and develop the five outcomes we were looking to achieve over a 3-year period - that the Historic Environment:* makes a real difference to people’s lives
* is looked after, protected, and managed for the generations to come
* makes a broader contribution to the economy of Scotland and its people
* inspires a creative and vibrant Scotland
* is cared for and championed by a high performing organisation

The Corporate Plan is now due for review and this brings it in to the scope of the Islands Communities Impact Assessment which was not in place in 2019. Only a light touch review is planned, retaining the same headline themes and objectives, with the intention to undertake a wider scale review for *Heritage for All* in 2023-24. However, this does provide an opportunity to consider whether the intended impacts/outcomes of the corporate plan do potentially differ in the islands as we would not wish to make decisions that would unilaterally disadvantage the islands. Even a light touch approach at this stage will help to understand the evidence base we currently have and the gaps in our knowledge and understanding we would potentially need to fill to undertake a wider review during 2023.The current Corporate Plan is nationwide in scope. In the original development of the Corporate Plan and its eventual publication the Islands were not specifically identified. The intended outcomes were at that point in time considered to be the same in the islands as on the mainland. For the purpose of the Corporate Plan refresh and associated assessment we need to consider all the island communities in relation to all our overarching outcomes and the historic environment as a whole, given that many elements of our responsibilities are Scotland wide. We should not just solely consider those islands where we have an operational responsibility in relation to the management of properties in care. |

|  |
| --- |
| **Step Two: Gather your data and identify your stakeholders** |
| * What data is available about the current situation in the islands?
* How does any existing data differ between the islands?
* Are there any existing design features or mitigations in place?
 |
| Our current knowledge relating to island communities is informed by the contextual data we draw on from a wide range of national surveys, the data HES holds regarding our estate and operations, bespoke heritage research projects plus our ongoing Islands engagement through our service delivery. This includes:Through our operations:* Direct site management of the 54 HES Properties In Care (PICs) on the various islands, including 9 which are staffed visitor attractions.
* Grants investment, including directly to organisations and individuals in island communities and working with other funders such as NLHF and AHF.
* Engagement through the community planning partnerships, economic development teams and planning authorities in Shetland, Orkney, [Comhairle nan Eilean Siar](https://www.cne-siar.gov.uk/), the Highlands and Argyll & Bute.
* Advice and support to individuals and organisations in relation to protecting, conserving, understanding and celebrating their heritage in their island communities.
* Working with other NDPBs, thematic groups and intermediaries who have island communities amongst their members – such as Visit Scotland, Creative Scotland, ASVA, STA, SURF, BEFS, DTAS, A&BS, SFHA, IofA, MGS
* Previous consultations for elements within HES’s overarching Plan, including for the 2021 HES Grants Refresh, Historic Environment Policy for Scotland: Two Years On, COVID19 sector surveys in 2020 and 2021, the Equality Outcomes Consultation and for the Orkney Gateway project.
* Feedback from our membership base and visitors, including regular surveys.
* Our people employed on or resident in the islands. There are currently 64 people working at HES’s island-based PICs – a figure which can rise due to seasonal employment. Island sites and communities are also supported by national services based in mainland depots and offices.

Through islands data analysis from sources to help inform the economic, social and environmental impacts of Heritage and where there are local concentrations of key beneficiary groups or pressures for a tailored local approach, including:* National demographic and social surveys (e.g. Scottish Household Survey and SIMD) to track the catchment and beneficiaries of the PICs and wider historic environment, and to better understand local engagement;
* National labour market and visitor surveys (the IPS, GBTS, GBDVS) to model the tourism and construction impacts of existing historic environment operations, and to understand local communities’ reliance on the employment generated through these channels.
* Asset registers to map the concentration of local traditionally build residential stock and employment space, scheduled and listed buildings, plus Buildings At Risk, to better understand the need for and scale of investment and skills.

Our current Corporate Plan reflects what we know through our evidence base and engagement. In reviewing our knowledge and evidence base we take the same approach across Scotland to identifying pressures, whether in rural, urban, or island locations. HES acknowledges that national surveys often struggle to produce reliable information for island communities due to their sample sizes and collection methods, so we work continuously with partners and communities to address these issues. The key island communities data and evidence we have is summarised below against each of the existing Corporate Plan themes, which will carry-over to the new Plan:**The Historic Environment makes a real difference to people’s lives*** Primary research conducted by HES in 2019 to establish the links between heritage engagement and individuals’ wellbeing did not find any statistically reliable differences in the rate or types of benefits reported between island and non-island areas, with 76% of respondents reporting that their overall life satisfaction was improved through engagement with the historic environment.
* Engagement with Historic Environment is marginally higher in island Local Authorities (LAs) than the Scottish average, with the Scottish Household Survey in 2019 reporting 39% of residents in island LAs visiting a historic site in the previous 12 months compared to 35% for Scotland as a whole.

**The Historic Environment is looked after, protected, and managed for the generations to come*** 54 of HES’s 336 PICs are on islands, including 9 which are staffed visitor attractions. They are managed through a central Asset Management process and strategy, assessed against the same principles as mainland sites. Practical works are delivered through a regional structure of maintenance depots and skills, and following HES’s procurement strategy for contractors and materials (which follows the Scottish Government’s statutory process).
* HES’s Climate Action Plan identified the island PICs as being at significant risk due to the high concentration of coastal sites affected by erosion and sea level rises, and the comparatively high exposure to weather conditions (wind, rain) than some mainland sites. This is factored into the sustainable asset management planning for all sites which informs investment prioritisation.
* Over the 5-year period 2016/17 to 2020/21, HES awarded over £9 million in direct grants to projects in islands Local Authorities. Extensive further archaeology related projects are also directly supported.
* Establishing the total number of traditionally constructed buildings in Scotland, and consequentially the investment and skills required to maintain and adapt them, is problematic at national level and further work is required. There is no single, definitive source to establish the full stock of pre-1919 buildings. The best identified source is the commercial GEOMNI database which suggests that 10-20% of Scotland’s residential stock and up to a quarter of employment space is in buildings constructed pre-1919, or with elements dating from that period. Around 40% of the database is not classified by age, though GEOMNI advise that this is predominantly non-occupiable structures such as bridges and transport infrastructure. However, there is a significantly higher rate of gaps for rural and island areas for both residential and employment space which will have to be supplemented with local data and knowledge.
* The Scottish House Condition Survey showed that over the period 2017-2019 the Island Authorities had significantly lower shares of urgent and critical disrepair to traditionally build residences than the Scottish average.

**The Historic Environment makes a broader contribution to the economy of Scotland and its people*** Over a third of international visitors list the historic environment as their main motivation for visiting Scotland, and half of international visitors engage with the historic environment during their visit. Visitors that include a historic environment visit in their trip spent over £3bn in Scotland in 2019. While regional impact estimates are less robust, all the Islands Local Authorities have a higher reliance on tourism in their overall employment mix than the Scottish average (8%) and heritage will play a key role.
* HES has PICs in each LA (though not all are on the Islands themselves) and in-house estimates show they make a considerable contribution to bringing tourism to the islands and sustaining local employment.

* The way that different tourists (e.g. cruise ship visitors, campervan visitors, B&B visitors, family visitors, activity visits) spend on the islands varies, as it does with different visitor types on the mainland sites. HES is working with VisitScotland and other heritage sector partners and local bodies to develop a national sustainable tourism approach and the role of heritage, and HES’s PICs within it to shape how we allocate resources across the estate.
* An estimated £1.2 billion is spent on repair & maintenance of traditionally constructed buildings in Scotland each year, with further employment benefits along the supply chain. As noted above, further work is required to establish the share of this total that is invested in R&M on Scottish islands, but it is likely to be a notable local employer.

**The Historic Environment inspires a creative and vibrant Scotland*** Through our local engagement and research we know that the historic environment is an integral part of island communities – both the built heritage and the intangible cultural heritage (ICH) shaping their sense of place, pride and traditions.
* The islands have unique and significant heritage assets, including some with World Heritage status (HONO, St Kilda).
* The historic environment provides creative inspiration for a variety of activities and events on the islands and they may be more reliant on ICH than other Scottish communities.

**The Historic Environment is cared for and championed by a high performing organisation*** HES is moving from a national to a regional model to deliver conservation works and visitor services so there will be more opportunities for bespoke regional decision making.
* Our planned approach is to work with local communities and find the best use for HES’s site and wider local infrastructure, working in partnership with local councils, organisations, trusts and residents alongside national agencies.
* HES has introduced a new Project Management Office and approval process for investment spending which will formally include the need to address Island Community Impact Assessments appropriately, factoring them into resource decisions. We recognise that there will be increased delivery costs due to the remote nature of some of the islands, and an impact on value for money assessments due to higher costs and smaller community catchments. Value for money assessments on the islands (and other rural areas) will therefore need to take into account things other than a pure finance-based cost-benefit analysis (such as the impact of providing jobs and skills in smaller communities).
* As we develop our digital offering, we are aware that some areas and island communities have issues with connectivity.

In conclusion, there is scope for wider recognition of some of the additional challenges islands face as we move towards the next iteration of the corporate plan. However, there is nothing identified in our approach which is likely to have effects on island communities which are significantly different from those on other communities (including other island communities). |

|  |
| --- |
| **Step Three: Consultation** |
| * Who do you need to consult?
* How will you carry out your consultation?
* What questions will you ask when considering how to address island realities?
* What information has already been gathered through consultations and what concerns have been raised?
 |
| The 2019 Corporate Plan was developed through [an engagement process](https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationId=f0218351-7fd6-426d-a7d2-aa2501193492) with an extensive geographical spread. In terms of the islands reach, this included engagement sessions at:• Westray through archaeological teams and separately with the Westray Development Trust• Shetland Hays Dock Museum• Fort Charlotte, Shetland• Visit Orkney• HIE Office, Inverness, including reps attending from Stornoway and Urras nan Tursachan• The Community Heritage Conference, with representation from Western Isles and Argyll and Isles cultural groups.• Argyll & Bute Museums and Heritage Forum Nothing specific was identified at that time that highlighted that the outcomes identified in the corporate plan would have an effect on an island community which is significantly different from its effect on other communities (including other island communities). No further public consultation is planned for this light-touch review and any minor changes will be made based on existing knowledge and data, including our on-going operations and engagement with island communities. A full consultation is intended during 2022 to inform the 2023/24 multi-year Corporate Plan review.  |

|  |
| --- |
| **Step Four: Assessment** |
| You must now determine whether in your opinion the policy, strategy or service is likely to have an effect on an island community which is significantly different from its effect on other communities (including other island communities). To form your opinion, the following questions should be considered (please delete YES/NO as appropriate) and any further explanation or evidence provided below:**Initial Assessment**With regards to HES’s approach: Does your assessment identify any unique impacts on island communities? **No**Does your assessment identify any potential barriers or wider impacts? **No**Does the evidence show different circumstances or different expectations or needs, or different experiences or outcomes (such as different levels of satisfaction, or different rates of participation)? **No** – some islands will have different circumstances, in the same way that different communities across Scotland will have different circumstances, and HES will plan to take the same approach to challenges regardless of location and tailor a solution that best fits the local area.Are these different effects likely or significantly different? **No (see above)**Could the effect amount to a disadvantage for an island community compared to the mainland or between island groups? **No.** There will be different pressures across communities in Scotland, but there is no evidence that HES’s approach will disadvantage island communities. **If your answers are NO to the above questions a full ICIA will be NOT be required and you can proceed to the final step.** All answers are “No” based on the evidence available and on HES’s intended approach, so a full ICIA is not required. The need for a full ICIA will be revisited in 2022 when designing the new sector strategy and Corporate Plan for 2023/24.  |
| **ICIA: Recommendations for shaping the Corporate Plan** |
| Please state how any adjustments are going to be made to your work to mitigate any effects on Island Communities. If no adjustments will be made please state this and include any justification. |
| While no significant issues have been identified around HES’s approach necessitating a significant change, there is scope for wider recognition of some of the additional challenges islands face as we move towards the next iteration of the corporate plan, including their higher cost base, relative reliance on tourism and local capacity. Given the high level of the plan, this could best be addressed with a sentence formally acknowledging that islands face different pressures, as indeed all communities will face different local circumstances, and that they are factored into HES wider engagement approach and planning.  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Approved by | Job Title | Date |
|  |  |  |
| Date logged  | Date published | Website link |